# Library Resource Discovery Services: What, Why, and How

Brian C. Gray, Team Leader, Research Services Arnold Hirshon, Associate Provost & University Librarian

Case Western Reserve University

EIFL General Assembly 2013 (Istanbul, Turkey)

# Today's Agenda

- Context
  - What is a discovery service?
  - Why use one? Are they right for all libraries or consortia?
  - EIFL participant survey results
- Goals
  - Compare and review the following options: Google Scholar, EBSCO, Serials Solutions, Ex Libris, OCLC
  - Help you identify which (if any) one of these solutions are right for you
- Factors to consider when selecting a service

# **Today's Presentation Format**

- Arnold will present a live overview and introduce video comments and demos by Brian Gray, Team Leader for Research Services at Case Western Reserve University
- The overview presentation will be followed by a short presentation by EBSCO about its discovery service product
- Questions and answers

# What is a Discovery Service?

- Pre-assembled index that covers many library electronic resources
  - Displays full text of all formats of materials to which the library has access (journals, books, repositories, etc.)
- Single search box
  - Advanced search features to limit, sort, and refine searches
- Consolidated search results
  - Results are displayed by relevance

## Types of Resources Accessible Via a Discovery Service (Sample)



What Discovery Services are <u>Not</u>: *Federated Searching* 

- Nearly extinct as a stand alone system
- Federated searching sent out searches on the web to various sources and then de-duplicated and displayed the results
- Inefficient and slow
- Did not always employ all of the features and metadata from each database it searched when it combined the results
- Results may not be sorted by relevancy but fastest to be returned (speed not relevant)

# When Should You Consider Using a Discovery Service?

- Library has access to many electronic resources
- Resources have a variety of access points
- Want to bring together print and electronic resources through a single search function
- Clientele of the library has interdisciplinary research needs
- Consortium wants to enrich exposure to its eresources
- Want to increase exposure to local resources, such as institutional repository

#### Growth in Discovery System Searches

(Case Western Reserve University: FY2011 vs. FY2012)

	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	March	April	May	June
				14	202	394	11,434	17,720	16,504	20,992	12,142	8,923
FY11												
	9,865	16,685	27,561	33,798	35,362	25,168	23,833	35,245	42,473	54,856	21,028	15,465
FY12												
# increase vs.				33,784	35,160	24,774	12,399	17,525	25,969	33,864	8,886	6,542
previous year												
% increase vs.				241314%	17406%	6288%	108%	99%	157%	161%	73%	73%
previous year												



## **Reduction in Library Catalog Searches**

(Case Western Reserve University: FY2011 vs. FY2012)



#### Discovery Service May <u>Not</u> be Needed if...

- Your library mostly has print materials
- Library has very few electronic resources or nearly all come from a single source (e.g., <5 resources) that are all contained in a few direct access points

# FYI ... at the end we will provide product comparison charts

	Google Scholar	EBSCO Discovery Service	Serials Solutions Summon	ExLibris Primo	OCLC WorldCat Local
Branding					
logos	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
skins	no	yes			
toolbar or banner	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
widgets	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
search boxes	no	yes	yes		yes
chat	no	yes	yes		yes
subject-specifc search boxes	no	yes	yes		
user surveys	no		yes		
custom URL	no	yes	yes		Yes

a blank box = unsure or information unavailable

## **EIFL Survey Respondents**

			<b>Consolidated List of Countries</b>			
per Country		per Country	Albania	Moldova		
Tanzania	10	Albania	Azerbaijan	Mongolia		
Latvia	9	Estonia	Belarus	Nepal		
Lithuania	8	Ghana	Estonia	Nigeria		
Nigeria	8	Kenya	Ethiopia	Palestine		
Azerbaijan	5	Kyrgyz	Ghana	Senegal		
Ethiopia	5	Republic Laos	Ghana	Serbia		
Macedonia	4	Malawi	Kenya	Slovenia		
Senegal	3	Nepal	Kyrgyz	Sudan		
Moldova	2	Serbia	Republic	Swaziland		
Mongolia	2	Slovenia	Laos	Tanzania		
J	2	Sudan	Latvia	Uganda		
Palestine Zambia		Swaziland	Lithuania	Ukraine		
Zambia	2	Uganda	Macedonia	Uzbekistan		
		Ukraine Uzbekistan	Malawi	Zambia		

#### EIFL Survey Consolidated Country Survey Responses Q1: currently using or considering using resource discovery tools

Yes	79%		
No	21%		

n=30

# EIFL Survey

#### **Consolidated Survey Responses** Q2: Commercial tools currently being used or under consideration

	EBSCO	ExLibris	OCLC	Serials	Other
		Primo		Solutions	
Currently Using	54%	4%	14%	0%	29%
Under Consideration	18%	18%	18%	18%	14%

- Responses were for countries that said "Yes" to Question 1.
- *Percentages shown are percentages of all responses (n=28).*
- Multiple responses were allowed for different products
- In consolidated results, if any response said "currently using," that response was counted for that country rather than "under consideration."

### EIFL Survey Consolidated Survey Responses Q2: Open source tools currently being used or under consideration

	VuFind	Google Scholar	Other
Currently Using	0%	51%	14%
Under Consideration	8%	8%	3%

In unified results, if any response said "currently using," that response was counted for that country rather than "under consideration."

#### **EIFL Survey**

# Q3: 2. If you are NOT using any resource discovery tools, rank which reasons are most or least important

#### Most Important Reasons [mean score = 1.6]

- Quotes from commercial vendors were too expensive
- Don't have in-house expertise to implement open source solutions

#### Less Important Reasons

- The benefits of using resource discovery tools are not clear to us [mean score = 2.3]
- Not a priority for our library [mean score = 2.9]

Scoring on a scale of 1 - 5 Lowest score = most important

## Videos with Brian Gray

1. Introduction to discovery service features



5. ExLibris Primo



## Video 1: Introduction

- About Brian Gray
- Key features of discovery services
- Link resolvers
- Customizing your service

Note: this video is available for download from the EIFL website as: video 1 introduction.mp4

# **Brian Gray**



- Case Western Reserve University
  - Team Leader Research Services; Engineering Librarian
  - Reference, collections, instructions, faculty liaison
  - Task force that investigated and picked Summon
- OhioLINK (Ohio consortium of academic libraries)
  - Task force that explored the design of local built solution, before commercial offerings existed
  - Task force that investigated and picked EBSCO
- Kent State University School of Library & Information Science
  - Teach technologies, including discovery

# **Key Features of Discovery Services**

- All are built upon connections driven by a link resolver
- May enable customization, such as:
  - End user accounts
  - Branding
  - Embedding your chat service
  - Turning off and on certain resources
  - Custom search boxes
  - Embedded widgets
  - Facets modifications
  - Language choices

# Key Features of Discovery Services

- Different systems use different methods
  - Leased/subscription: "Software as a Service," e.g., as EBSCO Discovery Service or ProQuest Summon
    - Often, regular updates and changes, but these are handled by the vendor
  - Open Source, such as VuFind
    - May require lots of local expertise and maintenance
- Content and underlying technology infrastructure philosophies may vary, but the results are largely the same

# Required for All Discovery Service: Link Resolvers

- Points to online resources
- Driven by knowledge bank or database
- Library maintains this database of subscriptions to databases, subscriptions to journals, and open access content
- <u>Advice</u>: it may reduce some of the work by using the link resolver and discovery service from same company



# Display Customization: Sample Language Settings

- Arabic
- Chinese Simplified
- Chinese Traditional
- Czech
- Dutch
- English (UK, US)
- Finnish
- French (Canada, France)
- German
- Hebrew
- Italian

- Japanese
- Korean
- Norwegian
- Polish
- Portuguese
- Russian
- Spanish (Latin America, Spain)
- Swedish
- Turkish
- Welsh

## **Customization Example: Facets**

- subject/topic
- keyword
- author
- title (article, book)
- ISBN, ISSN
- publication title (journal)
- volume & issue number
- publication date
- format/content type
- institution
- library location
- language
- audience
- publisher content

- content provider
- geography
- limit: only if fulltext is online
- limit: only scholarly materials
- limit: items in library catalog
- exclude: newspaper articles
- exclude: book reviews
- exclude: dissertations/theses
- expand: result beyond library collections
- databases
- modify facets (options)

## **Comparing the Products**

Google Scholar EBSCO Discovery Service Serials Solutions Summon ExLibris Primo OCLC WorldCat Local The next videos will compare each of these products against these key factors:

- Branding
- Content indexed
- Social networking tools and sharing
- Facets (search limiters)
- Language interfaces
- Statistics provided or available
- Mobile access tool available

#### For each of the five products, Brian's videos will provide:

- 1. An overview of the advantages, limitation, and things to consider about each product, and
- 2. Show a short "test drive in action" of a particularly interesting feature for each product

## Video 2: Google Scholar



Note: this video is available for download from the EIFL website as: video 2 google.mp4



#### <u>Advantages</u>

- Central index
- Journals, books, public indexes, patents, case law, citations, repositories (if submitted)
- Free

#### <u>Limitations</u>

- No formal support
- Google does not provide a list of resources that are indexed
  - Publishers or publications come and go
- Google may not know your access rights
  - Can link through link resolver/holdings
  - Publisher may notify Google that library has access to content (e.g., WoS)
- Relevancy rankings change and not documented

#### Things to Consider

• Local content not included (except you can submit IR)

## Video 3: EBSCO Discovery Service



Note: this video is available for download from the EIFL website as: video 3 EBSCO.mp4



#### <u>Advantages</u>

- Familiar interface (many existing databases on this platform)
- Options available to include consortium-wide content (e.g., union catalog)

#### <u>Limitations</u>

- Mix of databases and metadata
- May requires some "federation" (EBSCOhost Integrated Search)
  - External sources can be listed in sidebar and integrated in results by users

#### Things to Consider:

 Requires authentication to search all sources; guest searching limited to open resources

## Video 4: Serials Solutions Summon



Note: this video is available for download from the EIFL website as: video 4 summon.mp4



One search box... your library discovered.

#### <u>Advantages</u>

- No federation or links to external sources
- No "databases" but metadata from every major publisher
- Provides list of holdings
  - provides estimate of how much of a database's similar content is included
- Requires no authentication to search
  - Does require authentication to get to full text
- Created a new platform for a new product
- New upgrades and fixes every few weeks; software as service/agile

#### <u>Limitations</u>

- Constant change
  - changes prioritized by number of customer requests

#### Things to Consider

Updates and changes every few weeks

#### Video 5: Ex Libris Primo



Note: this video is available for download from the EIFL website as: video 5 ex libris primo.mp4



#### <u>Advantages</u>

- Built upon catalog technologies, relationships, and knowledge
- **Limitations**
- ?

#### Things to Consider

• Closer integration with existing catalog systems

## Video 6: OCLC WorldCat Local



Note: this video is available for download from the EIFL website as: video 6 worldcat local.mp4



#### <u>Advantages</u>

- Central Index
- Consortia integration
- Possible catalog replacement, includes some traditional catalog functions

#### <u>Limitations</u>

• Search facets and features are fewer in number

#### Things to Consider

• Are you existing OCLC customer? If not, this may not be the best "standalone" product for you
Why Use Google Scholar PLUS a Commercial Product?

### a few final things to consider

# Before and After You Choose

#### Before you commit to a service

- Pilot the tools
- Make sure you have sufficient staff resources
- Don't take forever to make a decision

#### After you commit to a service

- Don't take forever to implement the system
  - Don't plan for or expect perfection
  - Most errors are best discovered based upon actual usage
- Have your vendor do the work for you to do the setup
- Clean up holdings and link resolver in partnership with vendor
- Expect constant change and updates of features and content

Factors to Balance in Selecting a Service

- Price
- Your user needs
- What content is or is not included in the index?
- Individual institution or consortium approach
- Pricing for the link resolver plan
- Staff work required for initial installation and eholdings record maintenance
- Amount, type and language of content to be made accessible



	Č	Language		
		Afrikaans (627)		
		Albanian (20)		
		Amharic (85)		
100		Arabic (2,362)		
		Armenian (55)		
		Assamese (49)		
		Azerbaijani (105)		
		Basque (31)		
		Belarusian (20)		
-		Bengali (785)		
		Bosnian (56)		
		Bulgarian (109)		
		Burmese (2,185)		
		Catalan (457)		
		Central Khmer (36)		
		Chichewa (70)		
-		Chinese (57,880)		
		Church Slavic (309)		
		Chuvash (283)		
	(m)	Croatian (382)		
		Czech (2,881)		
		Danish (990)		
	<b>[</b> ]	Divehi (54)		
		Dutch (5,547)		
	<b></b>	English (20,718,182)		
-		Esperanto (18)		
		Estonian (178)		
		Ewe (15)		
		Finnish (456)		
-		French (103,297)		
		Fulah (15)		
		Gaelic (131)		
		Galician (22)		
-		German (87,800)		<b>[</b> ]
		Greek (1,519)		
		Gujarati (3,569)		
(m)		Hausa (56)		[m]
		Hebrew (7,702)		
		Hindi (7,167)		
-		Hungarian (546)		[PTT]
		Icelandic (106)		
		Indonesian (26,395)		[ <b>!</b> ]
		Irish (189)		
		Italian (14,294)		
		Japanese (4,935)		
		Javanese (193)		
		Kannada (1,472)		
-		Korean (337)		
	_	Lao (22)		

Latin (46,432)
Latvian (28)
Lithuanian (291)
Macedonian (22)
Malay (453)
Malayalam (1,509)
Manx (21)
Maori (19)
Marathi (3,467)
Mongolian (35)
Ndonga (31)
Nepali (497)
Norwegian (449)
Ojibwa (18)
Oriya (101)
Pali (252)
Panjabi (1,798)
Persian (3,387)
Polish (1,866)
Portuguese (9,358)
Pushto (453)
Quechua (21)
Romanian (253)
Russian (8,056)
Sanskrit (2,735)
Serbian (138)
sindhi (110)
Sinhala (225)
Slovak (231)
Slovenian (1,112)
Somali (96)
Sotho (35)
Spanish (47,940)
Swahili (109)
Swedish (2,766)
Tagalog (104)
Tamil (1,589)
Telugu (782)
Thai (268)
Tibetan (459)
Tswana (17)
Turkish (2,911)
Ukrainian (251)
Urdu (1,496)
Vietnamese (295)
Welsh (1,581)
Wolof (31)
Xhosa (58)
Yiddish (948)
Yoruba (30)
Zulu (64)

## Choosing Your Solution: Define What is Important in Your Situation

Factor to Consider	Your Library's Preferences
Affordability / price	
Institutional or consortial purchase?	
Institutional or consortial	
implementation?	
Branding	
Content indexed	
Social networking tools and sharing	
Link resolver	
Facets (Search limiters)	
Language interfaces	
Statistics provided or available	
Mobile access tool available	
Other considerations	

# Bibliography

- http://www.librarytechnology.org/discovery.pl
- http://www.infotoday.com/cilmag/apr12/Hoe ppner-Web-Scale-Discovery-Services.shtml
- Library Technology Reports, Web Scale Discover Services (v.47, issue 1, 2011)
- <u>http://www.scribd.com/doc/59958617/Evalua</u> <u>ting-and-Implementing-Web-Scale-Discovery-</u> <u>Services-Part-1</u>

### **Product Comparison Charts**

### Notes about the comparison charts

- The words "yes" or "no" appear only if that feature was confirmed for a specific product
- Where a cell is blank, this indicates that the feature <u>may</u> exist, but its availability could not be confirmed through openly-available resources

### Product Comparison Chart: Branding

	Google Scholar	EBSCO Discovery Service	Serials Solutions Summon	ExLibris Primo	OCLC WorldCat Local
Branding					
logos	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
skins	no	yes			
toolbar or banner	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
widgets	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
search boxes	no	yes	yes		yes
chat	no	yes	yes		yes
subject-specifc search boxes	no	yes	yes		
user surveys	no		yes		
custom URL	no	yes	yes		Yes

### Product Comparison Chart: Indexed Content

	Google Scholar	EBSCO Discovery Service	Serials Solutions Summon	ExLibris Primo	OCLC WorldCat Local
library catalog	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
consortia	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
catalog					
e-books	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
books	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
vendor	no	yes (direct	Creates index from	yes	yes
databases		partnership or by	content provider		
		connector)	metadata		
e-journals	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
newspapers	no	yes	yes		
publisher	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes (if licensed
content	(journals mostly)				)
open access	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
repositories					
institutional	yes (if submitted)	yes (if submitted)	Yes (if submitted	Yes (if	Yes (if
repositories			buy library)	submitted)	submitted)
theses	yes (if submitted)		yes		yes
LibGuides	no		yes		
other					>35M special
					collections, etc.

### Product Comparison Chart: Facets (1)

	Google Scholar	EBSCO Discovery Service	Serials Solutions Summon	ExLibris Primo	OCLC WorldCat Local
subject/topic	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
keyword	no				
author	no			yes	yes
title (article, book)	no				
ISBN, ISSN	no				
publication title (journal)	no	yes		yes	
volume & issue number	no				
publication date	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
format/content type (e.g., dissertation, map, music)	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
institution	no		yes		
library location	no	yes	yes		
language	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
audience	no				yes
publisher content	no	yes			

### Product Comparison Chart: Facets (2)

	Google Scholar	EBSCO Discovery Service	Serials Solutions Summon	ExLibris Primo	OCLC WorldCat Local
content provider	no	yes		yes	yes
geography	no	yes			
limit: only if full-text is online	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
limit: only scholarly materials	no	yes	yes	yes	
limit: items in library catalog	no	yes	yes	yes	
exclude: newspaper articles	no		yes		
exclude: book reviews	no		yes		
exclude: dissertations/theses	no		yes		
expand: result beyond library collections	no		yes	yes	
databases	no				yes
modify facets (options)	no		yes		

### Product Comparison Chart: Advanced Search

	Google Scholar	EBSCO Discovery Service	Serials Solutions Summon	ExLibris Primo	OCLC WorldCat Local
author	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
keyword	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes
subject	no	yes		yes	yes
title	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
publication	yes	yes	yes		
dates	yes	yes	yes	yes	
peer-reviewed/scholarly	no	yes	yes		yes
items In catalog	no	yes	yes	yes	
Location (local vs consortium) or expand beyond your library	no	yes	yes	yes	yes
language	no	yes		yes	
ISBN/ISSN	no	yes	yes	yes	
includes full text	no	yes	yes	yes	
format/content type	no	yes	yes		yes
exclude newspapers	no		yes		
exclude book reviews	no		yes		
exclude dissertations/theses	no		yes		

## Product Comparison Chart: Other (1)

	Google Scholar	EBSCO	Serials	ExLibris Primo	OCLC WorldCat
		Discovery	Solutions		Local
		Service	Summon		
Link Resolver	Library must	Library must	Library must	Library must	Library must
	provide link	provide link	provide link	provide link	provide link
	resolver	resolver	resolver	resolver	resolver
Social	no	standard	RefWorks,	incorporates	Social networking
networking		citation	EndNote,	Library 2.0 and	tools allow users to
tools and		programs;	BibTex; RSS	social computing	create and share
sharing		social	feed of	features—	lists, write reviews,
		bookmarking	search	enabling	rate items and
			strategy	institution	more.
				members to	
				share tags,	
				ratings, and	
				reviews.	
Language	13 languages	55 languages	34 language		11 languages
Interfaces			interfaces		
Statistics	no	yes	yes		yes
Available					
Mobile Access	yes (various	yes	yes	yes	yes
Available	options)				

## Product Comparison Chart: Other (2)

	Google Scholar	EBSCO Discovery Service	Serials Solutions Summon	ExLibris Primo	OCLC WorldCat Local
Additional	Scholar ranks			Consortia can	Branch-level holdings
Comments from	documents by			choose	displayed when Local
Provider	weighing the full text			configuration	Holdings Records are
	of each document,			options from	present.
	where it was			complete	Can configure a
	published, who it was			centralized control	group/consortial
	written by, and how			to total	catalog as a 2nd level
	often and recently it			independence	of relevance in search
	was cited in other			(each member	results.
	scholarly literature.			library able to	Users can link to
	Library Support			select its own	online resources, place
	Options at:			settings for search	holds request items, &
	http://www.google.c			options, user	borrow from other
	om/intl/en/scholar/li			interface,	libraries
	braries.html			calculation of item	
				availability, &	
				delivery).	
Information	http://scholar.google.com/intl				
	<u>/en/scholar/about.html</u>	.com/discovery	<u>utions.com/en/servic</u> es/summon/	om/category/PrimoOvervie <u>w</u>	<u>US/worldcat-local.html</u>

## Questions?

CWRU website, including Summon implementation: <u>http://library.case.edu</u>

### Arnold Hirshon

Associate Provost & University Librarian arnold.hirshon@case.edu

#### **Brian Gray**

Team Leader Research Services brian.c.gray@case.edu